

Abbreviated Value Framework Matrix for Rock Island Relicensing Early Action Assesement - DRAFT

| Value Group | Value Measure | Early Action Topic | A1) CONSEQUENCE - | A2) CONSEQUENCE 30 | A3) CONSEQUENCE 100 | A4) CONSEQUENCE 300 | A5) CONSEQUENCE 1000 | A6) CONSEQUENCE 3000 | A7) CONSEQUENCE 10000 | A8) CONSEQUENCE 30000 | A9) CONSEQUENCE 100000 |
|----------------------------------|---|---------------------|--|---|--|--|---|---|---|--|---|
| Environmental Stewardship | Environmental Impact Risk | Environmental Value | No environmental value | Prevents or remediates negligible environmental impacts | Prevents or remediates short-term or easily mitigated environmental impact | Prevents or remediates moderate, or significant but repairable environmental impacts | Prevents or remediates moderate environmental impact that has a potential to increase | Prevents or remediates moderate, irreversible environmental impacts | Prevents or remediates long-term or major environmental damage | Prevents or remediates uncontrolled environmental damage with negligence, repeat, or major remediation | Prevents irradiation of species, material impacts to endangered species, or other major irreversible environmental impact |
| Stakeholder / Customer Relations | Public Perception & Stakeholder Relations | Recreation Value | No recreation value | Provides recreational value to a few people | Provides recreational value to few customer-owners | Provides recreational value to a small community | Provides recreational value to a small community of customer-owners | Provides recreational value to a large community of people | Provides recreational value to a large community of customer-owners | Provides recreational value to all customer-owners | |
| | | Educational Value | No educational value | | Provides educational value to a few customer-owners | | Provides educational value to a small community of customer-owners | | Provides educational value to a large community of customer-owners | Provides educational value to all customer-owners | |
| | | Economic Value | Doesn't support Chelan County economic development | | Supports economic development of a few customer-owners | | Supports economic development of a a small community of customer-owners | | Supports economic development of a large community of customer-owners | Supports economic development of all customer-owners | |
| | | Cost Sharing Value | No Cost Sharing | A few people contribute to cost sharing | A few key stakeholders contribute to cost sharing | A small community of people contribute to cost sharing | A small community of key stakeholders contribute to cost sharing | A large community of people contribute of cost sharing | A large community of key stakeholders contribute to cost sharing | All key stakeholders contribute to cost sharing | |

Summary Table: Rock Island Relicensing Early Action Proposals 2020

| Proposal Number | Project | Proponent | Proposal for Early Action | Requested Funding (\$) | Basis of Funding Level | Chelan PUD Total Expected Cost Low (\$)¹ | Chelan PUD Total Expected Cost High (\$)¹ | Environmental Value (points) | Recreation Value (points) | Educational Value (points) | Economic Value (points) | Cost Sharing Value (points) | Project Achievability | Total Adjusted Value = Points x Achievability | Cost Low (points) | Cost High (points) | Value/Cost (points) Ratio Low | Value/Cost (points) Ratio High |
|-----------------|---|--|---|------------------------|---|--|---|------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------|---|-------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| #4b | Modify / Improve the Chelan County Side of the Loop Trail at PUD sites | Chelan PUD (proposed altenative to #4) | Conduct a study of options to improve/modify the Loop Trail in Chelan County | \$30,000 | PUD estimate for studies at PUD sites | \$200,000 | \$2,000,000 | 0 | 10000 | 0 | 0 | 1000 | 90% | 9,900 | 300 | 3,000 | 33.00 | 3.30 |
| #3g | Redesign the Horan Natural Area existing trail system to provide full accessibility to visitors | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Redesign the Horan Natural Area existing trail system to provide full accessibility to visitors | \$35,000 | This is an estimate, no cost was provided. | \$10,000 | \$50,000 | 0 | 1000 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 80% | 880 | 30 | 100 | 29.33 | 8.80 |
| #4 | Modify / Improve the Chelan County Side of the Loop Trail | The City of Wenatchee | Conduct a study of options to improve/modify the Loop Trail in Chelan County | \$70,000 | Funding requested for non-Confluence Parkway section | \$200,000 | \$2,000,000 | 0 | 10000 | 0 | 0 | 1000 | 80% | 8,800 | 300 | 3,000 | 29.33 | 2.93 |
| #3b | Enhance Bird Viewing at Rock Island Ponds | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Conduct an assessment & establish a long-term survey of bird species at Rock Island Ponds | \$20,000 | Unknown, this is an estimate, volunteer labor would be provided | \$5,000 | \$20,000 | 30 | 300 | 100 | 0 | 300 | 100% | 730 | 30 | 30 | 24.33 | 24.33 |
| #2b | Upgrade Existing Chelan PUD Access Points to Rock Island Ponds | Chelan PUD (proposed alternative to #2) | Conduct Evaluation of Upgrading Existing Chelan PUD Access Points | \$30,000 | Rough Estimate from Chelan PUD, who is proposing this option. | \$100,000 | \$300,000 | 100 | 300 | 0 | 0 | 3000 | 80% | 320 | 10,000 | 30,000 | 3.20 | 1.07 |
| #1 | Malaga Waterfront Park | Malaga-Colockum Community Council & Chelan County Commissioners | Conduct a site suitability analysis and traffic impact evaluation | \$37,500 | 50% of Site suitability analysis (\$65k) and traffic analysis (\$10k) | \$3,500,000 | \$7,625,000 | 0 | 1000 | 0 | 100 | 10000 | 80% | 8,880 | 3,000 | 10,000 | 2.96 | 0.89 |
| #3i | Replace the chain link fence in the south portion of the Horan Natural Area trail network | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Explore alternatives to replace the chain link fence in the Horan Natural Area | \$5,000 | This is an estimate, no cost was provided. | \$1,000 | \$40,000 | 30 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 50% | 65 | 30 | 30 | 2.17 | 2.17 |
| #3e | Develop a vegetation management plan for the Horan Natural Area | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Develop a vegetation management plan for the Horan Natural Area | \$100,000 | This is an estimate, no cost was provided. | \$80,000 | \$125,000 | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 50% | 100 | 100 | 100 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| #3a | Recreational Enhancements at Rock Island Ponds | North Central Washington Audubon Society, benefits City of Rock Island | Conduct baseline studies to enable recreational enhancements at Rock Island Ponds | \$60,000 | This is an estimate, no value was provided | \$500,000 | \$2,000,000 | 300 | 300 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 90% | 810 | 3,000 | 10,000 | 0.27 | 0.08 |
| #3h | Explore reducing the size of the existing radio tower wires in the Horan Natural Area | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Reduce the size of the existing radio tower wires in the Horan Natural Area | \$30,000 | This is an estimate, no cost was provided. | \$150,000 | \$500,000 | 30 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 30% | 39 | 300 | 1,000 | 0.13 | 0.04 |
| #2 | Recreational Enhancements in the Rock Island Ponds and Waterfront areas | City of Rock Island (see proposed alternative #2b) | Develop Recreation Vision and Strategic Plan Document for the City of Rock Island | \$63,282 | 75% of a Plan Document (25% from Douglas County) | \$9,000,000 | \$27,000,000 | 0 | 300 | 0 | 0 | 3000 | 30% | 990 | 10,000 | 30,000 | 0.10 | 0.03 |
| #3c | Reestablish water in the Horan Area | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Reestablish water in the Horan Area | N/A | Unknown but in excess of \$125,000 | \$0 | \$0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | - | - | - | >\$125k | |
| #3d | Construct a site honoring Native American history and cultural use of the Horan Nat. Area | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Construct a site honoring Native American history and cultural use of the Horan Nat. Area | N/A | Unknown but in excess of \$125,000 | \$0 | \$0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | - | - | - | >\$125k | |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--|--|--|-----|------------------------------------|-----|-----|---|---|---|---|---|----|---|---|---|---------|
| #3f | Construct a multi-purpose nature center | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Construct a multi-purpose nature center | N/A | Unknown but in excess of \$125,000 | \$0 | \$0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | - | - | - | >\$125k |
| #3j | Purchase the private lands in the southwest corner of the Horan Natural Area | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Purchase the private lands in the southwest corner of the Horan Natural Area | N/A | Unknown but in excess of \$125,000 | \$0 | \$0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | - | - | - | >\$125k |
| #3k | Reestablish the Miller trading post on its original site | North Central Washington Audubon Society | Reestablish the Miller trading post on its original site | N/A | Unknown but in excess of \$125,000 | \$0 | \$0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | - | - | - | >\$125k |

1) Costs to Chelan PUD include initial outlay and any expected ongoing costs for the life of the license (50 years).